No. 51 of 1981

IN THE JUDICIAL COMMITTEE OF THE PRIVY COUNCIL

O N A P P E A L FROM THE FEDERAL COURT OF MALAYSIA

BETWEEN:

KOH KIM CHAI

Appellant (Chargor/Respondent)

- and -

ASIA COMMERCIAL BANKING CORPORATION LIMITED $\frac{Respondent}{(Chargee/Applicant)}$

RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS

KINGSFORD DORMAN 14 Old Square Lincoln's Inn London WC2A 3UB.

Solicitors for the Appellant

COWARD CHANCE Royex House Aldermanbury Square London EC2V 7LD.

Solicitors for the Respondent

No. 51 of 1981				
IN THE JUDICIAL COMMITTEE OF THE PRIVY COUNCIL				
ON APPI	E A L			
FROM THE FEDERAL COURT OF MALAYSIA				
BETWEE	<u> N</u> :			
KOH KIM CHAI	Appellant (Chargor/Respon	ndent)		
- and -				
ASIA COMMERCIAL BANKING CORPORATION LIMITED Respondent (Chargee/Applicant)				
RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS				
INDEX OF REFERENCE				
No. Description of Document	Date	Page No.		
IN THE HIGH COURT IN MALAYA AT JOHORE BAHRU				
1. Originating Summons	7 June 1977	1-3		
 Order of Syed Othman Bin Ali J. 	28 December 1978	4-6		
IN THE FEDERAL COURT OF MALAYSIA AT JOHORE BAHRU				
3. Order of the Federal Court	24 June 1980	6-7		
4. Order granting conditional leave to appeal	4 August 1980	7 - 9		
5. Order granting final leave to appeal to H.M. the Yang Di- Pertuan Agong	7 March 1981	9-11		

INDEX OF REFERENCE (continued)

DOCUMENTS TRANSMITTED TO THE JUDICIAL COMMITTEE BUT NOT REPRODUCED

No.	Description of Document	Date
1.	Affidavit of Ong Beng Tiong	16 May 1977
2.	Affidavit of Koh Kim Chai	12 February 1978
3.	Affidavit of Lim Cheun Ren	19 April 1978
4.	Affidavit of Koh Kim Chai	31 July 1978
5.	Notice informing that "further arguments would be heard in Open Court on 29 October 1978"	3 October 1978
6.	Notes of Proceedings in Chambers and in Open Court	16 October 1977 to 28 December 1978
7.	Grounds of Judgment of Syed Othman Bin Ali J.	28 December 1978
8.	Notice of Appeal to Federal Court	31 December 1978
9.	Memorandum of Appeal	8 November 1979
10.	Grounds of Judgment of the Federal Court	24 June 1980
11.	Notice of Motion	18 J uly 1980
12.	Affidavit of Koh Kim Chai	14 July 1980
13.	Affidavit of Poh Kar Chiow	29 July 1980
14.	Affidavit of Sivaran Singh Gill	31 July 1980
15.	Affidavit of R. Padmanabhan	2 August 1980

IN THE JUDICIAL COMMITTEE OF THE PRIVY COUNCIL

ON APPEAL

FROM THE FEDERAL COURT OF MALAYSIA

B E T W E E N :

KOH KIM CHAI

Appellant (Chargor/Respondent)

- and -

ASIA COMMERCIAL BANKING CORPORATION LIMITED

Respondent
(Chargee/Applicant)

10

20

RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS

No. 1 ORIGINATING SUMMONS

In the High Court of Malaya at Johore Bahru

IN THE HIGH COURT OF MALAYA AT JOHORE BAHRU CHARGEE'S APPLICATION

No. 1

ORIGINATING SUMMONS)
NO. 145 of 1977)

Originating Summons

7 June 1977

In the Matter of a Chargee's Application under Sections 256 and 257 of the

AND

National Land Code, Act No. 56 of 1965

In the Matter of a Charge dated the 22nd day of May 1973 bearing Presentation No. 5639/73, Charge Volume 179, Folio 2 on all that piece of land comprised and delineated in Grant 23940, Lot 2605, Mukim of Senai, Kulai, Johore

BETWEEN

DEIME

In the High Court of Malaya at Johore Bahru

No. 1

Originating Summons

7 June 1977

continued

ASIA COMMERCIAL BANKING
CORPORATION LIMITED of No.110
Robinson Road, Singapore, 1.
Chargee/Applicant

AND

KOH KIM CHAI of No. 2-E Jalan Ah Fook, Johore Bahru Chargor/Respondent

10

20

30

ORIGINATING SUMMONS

LET KOH KIM CHAI of No. 2-E, Jalan Ah Fook, Wong Shee Fun Building, Johore Bahru within eight (8) days after service of this Summons on him, inclusive of the date of such service, cause an appearance to be entered for him to this Summons, which is issued upon the application of the abovenamed Chargee/Applicant, ASIA COMMERCIAL BANKING CORPORATION LIMITED of No. 110 Robinson Road, Singapore, 1 for an Order:-

- 1. That all that piece of land comprised in Grant 23940, Lot 2605 in the Mukim of Senai, Kulai and containing an area of 53 Acres 0 Rood 30 Poles or thereabouts be sold by public auction under the direction of The Senior Assistant Registrar;
- That the sale be held on a date not less than one month after the date upon which this Order is made;
- 3. That the total amount due to the Chargee/Applicant in respect of the principal and interest up to the 9th day of January 1975 is \$499,463.26 which sum together with interest at the rate of 14.75% per annum to the 31st day of March 1977 amounts to \$680,003-38;
- 4. That the Chargee/Applicant is further entitled to interest at the rate of 14.75% per annum with monthly rests from the date of this Order to the date of realisation.
- 5. That the Senior Assistant Registrar of the Court shall further fix a reserve price for the purposes of the said sale equal to the estimated market value of the said land;
- 6. That there be liberty to all parties to apply;
- 7. That the costs, charges, expenses of and incidental 40

to this application and of the sale hereby directed be taxed by the Senior Assistant Registrar on the Higher Scale and be paid by the Chargor/Respondent to the Chargee/Applicant and the amount of such costs, charges and expenses when duly taxed may be added by the Chargee/Applicant to the amount due for principal and interest owing under the said Charge.

Dated this 7th day of June 1977,

Sgd. Illegible

SENIOR ASSISTANT REGISTRAR, HIGH COURT, MALAYA, JOHORE BAHRU.

Entered No. 522/77

10

20

30

This Summons is taken out by Messrs. Yeow & Chin of No. 16-B, Jalan Station, Tan Chan Cheng Building, Johore Bahru, Solicitors for the abovenamed Chargee/Applicant.

The Chargor/Respondent may appear hereto by entering an appearance either personally or by Solicitor at the Registry of the High Court at Johore Bahru.

 $\overline{\text{NOTE}}$: If the Chargor/Respondent does not enter appearance within the time and at the place above-mentioned, such order will be made and proceedings taken as the Judge may think just and expedient.

A person appearing personally may, if he desires, enter his appearance by post and the appropriate forms may be obtained by sending a Postal Order for \$5-00 with an addressed envelope to the Senior Assistant Registrar of the High Court at Muar.

To:

Koh Kim Chai, 2-E, Jalan Ah Fook, Wong Shee Fun Building, JOHORE BAHRU. In the High Court of Malaya at Johore Bahru

No. 1

Originating Summons

7 June 1977

continued

In the High No. 2 Court of Malaya at Johore Bahru ORDER OF SYED OTHMAN BIN ALI J. No. 2 IN THE HIGH COURT IN MALAYA AT JOHORE BAHRU CHARGEE'S APPLICATION Order of Syed Othman Bin Ali J. ORIGINATING SUMMONS) No. 145 of 1977 28 December 1978 In the Matter of a Chargee's Application under Sections 256 and 257 of the National Land Code, Act No. 56 of 1965 10 AND In the Matter of a Charge dated the 22nd day of May 1973 bearing Presentation No. 5639/73, Charge Volume 179, Folio 2 on all that piece of land comprised and delineated in Grant 23940, Lot 2605 Mukim of Senai, Kulai, Johore BETWEEN ASIA COMMERCIAL BANKING CORPORATION 20 LIMITED of No. 110 Robinson Road, Singapore, 1 Chargee/Applicant AND KOH KIM CHAI of No. 2-E, Jalan Ah Fook, Johore Bahru Chargor/Respondent BEFORE THE HONOURABLE MR. IN CHAMBERS JUSTICE DATO' SERI SYED OTHAMAN BIN ALI THIS 28th DAY OF DECEMBER, 1978 30 ORDER UPON the application on the part of ASIA

UPON the application on the part of ASIA COMMERCIAL BANKING CORPORATION LIMITED, the abovenamed Chargee/Applicant, made by way of Originating Summons Entered No. 522 of 1977 dated the 7th day of June 1977 coming on for hearing on 23rd day of April, 1978 AND UPON further argument in Open Court on the 31st day of July 1978, 29th day of October 1978 and 28th day of December 1978 AND UPON READING the said Originating 40

Summons and the Affidavit of Ong Beng Tiong affirmed on the 16th day of May 1977 and filed herein on the 7th day of June 1977 and the exhibits referred to therein and the Affidavit of A. Ghani bin Md. Tahir affirmed and filed on the 18th day of July 1977 and the exhibit referred to therein and the Affidavit of Lim Cheun Ren affirmed on the 19th day of April 1978 and filed herein on the 23rd day of April 1978 and the exhibit referred to therein and the Affidavit of Koh Kim Chai affirmed and filed herein on the 12th day of February 1978 and the further Affidavit of Koh Kim Chai affirmed and filed herein on the 31st day of July 1978 AND UPON HEARING Miss Cheah Che Kwe of Counsel for the abovenamed Chargee/Applicant and Mr. Paramjothy of Counsel for the above Charger/Respondent THIS COURT DOTH ORDER :-

In the High Court of Malaya at Johore Bahru

No. 2

Order of Syed Othman Bin Ali J.

28 December 1978

continued

- 1. That all that piece of land comprised in Grant 23940, Lot 2605 in the Mukim of Senai, Kulai and containing an area of 53 Acres O Rood 30 Poles or thereabouts be sold by public auction under the direction of the Senior Assistant Registrar;
- 2. That the sale be held on a date not later than one month after the date upon which this Order is made;
- 3. That the total amount due to the Chargee/Applicant in respect of the principal and interest at the rate of 14.75% per annum up to the 23rd day of April 1978 amounts to \$790,261-20;
- 4. That the Chargee/Applicant is further entitled to interest at the rate of 14.75% per annum with monthly rests from the 23rd day of April 1978 to the date of realisation;
- 5. That the Senior Assistant Registrar of the Court shall further fix a reserve price for the purposes of the said sale equal to the estimated market value of the said land;
- 6. That there be liberty to all parties to apply;
- 7. That the costs, charges, expenses of and incidental to this application and of the sale hereby directed be taxed by The Senior Assistant Registrar on the Higher Scale and be paid by the Chargor/Respondent to the Chargee/Applicant and the amount of such costs, charges and expenses when duly taxed be added by the Chargee/Applicant to the amount due

10

30

40

for principal and interest owing under the In the High Court of Malaya said Charge. at Johore Bahru GIVEN under my hand and the Seal of the Court, this 28th day of December, 1978. No. 2 Sd. Abdul Kadir bin Musa. Order of Syed Othman Bin Ali J. Senior Assistant Registrar, High Court, Malaya, 28 December 1978 JOHORE BAHRU. continued No. 3 In the Federal Court of Malaysia 10 ORDER OF THE FEDERAL COURT at Johore Bahru IN THE FEDERAL COURT OF MALAYSIA HOLDEN AT No. 3 JOHORE BAHRU Order of the (APPELLATE JURISDICTION) Federal Court FEDERAL COURT CIVIL APPEAL NO. 5 OF 1979 24 June 1980 Between Appellant KOH KIM CHAI And ASIA COMMERCIAL BANKING Respondents CORPORATION LIMITED (In the Matter of Johore Bahru High Court 20 Originating Summons No. 145 of 1977) Between Chargee/ ASIA COMMERCIAL BANKING Applicant CORPORATION LIMITED And Chargor/ KOH KIM CHAI Respondent LEE HUN HOE, CHIEF JUSTICE, HIGH CORAM: COURT, BORNEO; WAN SULEIMAN, JUDGE, FEDERAL COURT, MALAYSIA; 30 ABDUL HAMID, JUDGE, FEDERAL COURT, MALAYSIA. IN OPEN COURT

THIS 24th DAY OF JUNE 1980

ORDER

THIS APPEAL coming on for hearing on the 3rd day of February 1980 in the presence of Encik V.C. George (Encik K.S. Narayanan with him) of Counsel for the Appellant and Encik Upali Masacorale (Encik Lim Cheun Ren with him) of Counsel for the Respondent AND UPON READING the Record of Appeal filed herein AND UPON HEARING Counsel as aforesaid for the parties IT WAS ORDERED that this Appeal do stand adjourned for Judgment AND the same coming on for Judgment this day at Kaula Lumpur in the presence of Encik V.C. George (Encik K.S. Narayanan with him) of Counsel for the Appellant and Encik Gan Eng Chee of Counsel for the Respondents IT IS ORDERED that this Appeal be and is hereby dismissed with costs to be taxed and be paid to the Respondents by the Appellant AND IT IS LASTLY ORDERED that the sum of \$500-00 (Ringgit Five Hundred only) paid into Court by the Appellant as security for costs of this Appeal be paid out to the Respondents towards taxed costs.

In the Federal Court of Malaysia at Johore Bahru

No. 3

Order of the Federal Court

24 June 1980

continued

Given under my hand and the Seal of the Court, this 24th day of June 1980.

(Sgd.) A.S. TAN

SENIOR ASSISTANT REGISTRAR, FEDERAL COURT, MALAYSIA, KUALA LUMPUR.

No. 4

ORDER GRANTING CONDITIONAL LEAVE TO APPEAL

IN THE FEDERAL COURT OF MALAYSIA HOLDEN AT KUALA LUMPUR

(APPELLATE JURISDICTION)

FEDERAL COURT CIVIL APPEAL NO. 5 OF 1979

BETWEEN

KOH KIM CHAI

10

20

30

Appellant

AND

ASIA COMMERCIAL BANKING
CORPORATION LIMITED

Respondent

No. 4

Order granting conditional leave to appeal

4 August 1980

In the Federal at Johore Bahru

(In the Matter of Johore Bahru High Court Chargee's Court of Malaysia Application Originating Summons No. 145 of 1977)

No. 4

Order granting conditional leave to appeal BETWEEN

Asia Commercial Banking Corporation Limited Chargee/Applicant

AND

4 August 1980

Koh Kim Chai

CORAM:

Chargor/Respondent

continued

LEE HUN HOE, CHIEF JUSTICE, HIGH COURT, BORNEO; CHANGE MIN TAT, JUDGE, FEDERAL COURT, MALAYSIA; SALLEH ABAS, JUDGE, FEDERAL COURT, MALAYSIA

10

40

IN OPEN COURT THIS 4TH DAY OF AUGUST 1980

UPON MOTION made unto the Court this day by Encik V.C. George of Counsel for the Appellant above-named in the presence of Encik Lim Cheun Ren Counsel for the Respondent abovenamed AND UPON READING the Appellant's Notice of Motion dated the 18th day of July 1980, the Affidavit of Koh Kim Chai affirmed on the 14th day of 20 July 1980, the Affidavit of Poh Kar Chiow affirmed on the 29th day of July 1980, the Affidavit of Sivaran Singh Gill affirmed on the 31st day of July 1980 and the Affidavit of R. Padmanabhan on the 2nd day of August 1980 all filed herein AND UPON HEARING Counsel for the Appellant and Counsel for the Respondent as aforesaid IT IS ORDERED that leave be and is hereby granted to the Appellant to appeal to His Majesty the Yang Di-Pertuan Agong against 30 the whole of the decision of this Honourable Court given on the 24th day of June 1980 in Federal Court Civil Appeal No. 4 of 1979 which said decision is binding in this Appeal and in Federal Court Civil Appeal No. 3 of 1979, upon the following conditions:-

three (3) months from the date hereof enter into good and sufficient security to the satisfaction of the Chief Registrar of the Federal Court in the sum of M\$5,000.00 (Ringgit Five Thousand) only for the due prosecution of the Appeal and the payment of all such costs as may become payable to the Respondent abovenamed in the event of the abovenamed Appellant not obtaining an Order granting final leave to appeal

that the Appellant abovenamed do within

8.

or of the Appeal being dismissed for

non-prosecution or of His Majesty the Yang Di-Pertuan Agong ordering the abovenamed Respondent costs of the Appeal as the case may be; and

In the Federal Court of Malaysia at Johore Bahru

(b) that the abovenamed Appellant do within three (3) months from the date hereof take the necessary steps for the purpose of procuring the preparation of the Appeal Record and despatch thereof to England.

10

20

30

No. 4

Order granting conditional leave to appeal

4 August 1980

continued

AND IT IS FURTHER ORDERED That the Appellant's prayer (b) contained in the Notice of Motion dated the 18th day of July 1980 requesting for the stay of execution of the Judgment of this Honourable Court given on the 24th day of June 1980 pending appeal on the said judgment to His Majesty the Yang Di-Pertuan Agong be and is hereby allowed AND IT IS LASTLY ORDERED that costs of the Appellant's application be costs in the cause.

GIVEN under my hand and the Seal of the Court this 4th day of August 1980.

(Sd.) A.S. TAN

Senior Assistant Registrar Federal Court, Malaysia, Kuala Lumpur.

This Order is filed by Messrs. Ng Ek Teong & Partners of 2nd Floor, Bangunan Persatuan Hokkien Selangor, Jalan Raja Chulan, Kuala Lumpur, Solicitors for the Appellant abovenamed.

No. 5

No. 5

ORDER GRANTING FINAL LEAVE TO APPEAL

Order granting final leave to appeal

IN THE FEDERAL COURT OF MALAYSIA HOLDEN AT JOHORE BAHRU

7 March 1981

(APPELLANT JURISDICTION)

FEDERAL COURT CIVIL APPEAL NO. 5 of 1979

Between

In the Federal Court of Malaysia at Johore Bahru

Koh Kim Chai

Appellant

And

No. 5

Order granting final leave to Appeal

7 March 1981

continued

Asia Commercial Banking Corporation Limited

Respondent

(In the Matter of Johore Bahru High Court Originating Summons No. 145 of 1977)

Between

Asia Commercial Banking Corporation Limited

Chargee/Applicant

And

10

Koh Kim Chai

Chargor/Respondent

CORAM: WAN SULEIMAN, ACTING CHIEF JUSTICE, HIGH COURT, MALAYA; SALLEH ABAS, JUDGE, FEDERAL COURT, MALAYSIA; ABDUL HAMID, JUDGE, FEDERAL COURT,

MALAYSIA.

ORDER

IN OPEN COURT
THIS 7TH DAY OF MARCH 1981

UPON MOTION made on to Court this day by 20 Encik C. Paramjothy of Counsel for the Appellant and Encik Sivaran Singh Gill of Counsel for the Respondent above-named AND UPON READING the Notice of Motion dated the 30th January 1981 and the Affivit of Encik K.S. Narayanan affirmed on the 29th January 1981 AND UPON HEARING Counsel for the Appellant aforesaid and Encik S.S. Gill Counsel for the Respondent abovenamed IT IS ORDERED that final leave be and is hereby granted to the Appellant to appeal to His Majesty the Yang Di-Pertuan Agong against the whole of the decision of this Honourable Court given on the 24th June 1980 in Federal Court Civil Appeal No. 4 of 1979 which said decision is binding in this Appeal and in Federal Court Civil Appeal No. 3 of 1979.

Given under my hand and seal of the Court this 7th day of March 1981.

(Sd.) A.S. TAN

40

SENIOR ASSISTANT REGISTRAR, FEDERAL COURT, MALAYSIA, KUALA LUMPUR.

This Order is filed by M/s Ng Ek Teong & Partners, Solicitors for the Appellant abovenamed whose address for service is at 2nd Floor, Bangunan Persatuan Hokkien Selangor, Jalan Raja Chulan, Kuala Lumpur.

In the Federal Court of Malaysia at Johore Bahru

No. 5

Order granting final leave to Appeal

7 March 1981

continued

IN THE JUDICIAL COMMITTEE OF THE PRIVY COUNCIL

O N A P P E A L FROM THE FEDERAL COURT OF MALAYSIA

BETWEEN:

KOH KIM CHAI

Appellant (Chargor/Respondent)

- and -

ASIA COMMERCIAL BANKING CORPORATION LIMITED

Respondent
(Chargee/Applicant)

RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS

KINGSFORD DORMAN 14 Old Square Lincoln's Inn London WC2A 3UB.

Solicitors for the Appellant

COWARD CHANCE Royex House Aldermanbury Square London EC2V 7LD.

Solicitors for the Respondent