1/84

IN THE JUDICIAL COMMITTEE OF THE PRIVY COUNCIL

ON APPEAL

FROM THE FEDERAL COURT OF MALAYSIA

BETWEEN:

KOH KIM CHAI

Appellant (Chargor/Respondent)

- and **-**

ASIA COMMERCIAL BANKING CORPORATION LIMITED <u>Respondent</u> (Chargee/Applicant)

RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS

KINGSFORD DORMAN 14 Old Square Lincoln's Inn London WC2A 3UB.

Solicitors for the Appellant COWARD CHANCE Royex House Aldermanbury Square London EC2V 7LD.

Solicitors for the Respondent

IN THE JUDICIAL COMMITTEE OF THE PRIVY COUNCIL

ON APPEAL

FROM THE FEDERAL COURT OF MALAYSIA

BETWEEN:

KOH KIM CHAI

Appellant (Chargor/Respondent)

- and -

ASIA COMMERCIAL BANKING CORPORATION LIMITED <u>
Respondent</u> (Chargee/Applicant)

RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS

INDEX OF REFERENCE

<u>No.</u>	Description of Document	Date	Page No.
	IN THE HIGH COURT IN MALAYA AT JOHORE BAHRU		
1.	Originating Summons	7 June 1977	1-3
2.	Order of Syed Othman Bin Ali J.	28 December 1978	4-6
	IN THE FEDERAL COURT OF MALAYSIA AT JOHORE BAHRU		
3.	Order of the Federal Court	24 June 1980	6-7
4.	Order granting conditional leave to appeal	4 August 1980	7-9
5.	Order granting final leave to appeal to H. M. the Yang Di- Pertuan Agong	7 March 1981	9-11

INDEX OF REFERENCE (continued)

DOCUMENTS TRANSMITTED TO THE JUDICIAL COMMITTEE BUT NOT REPRODUCED

No.	Description of Document	Date
1.	Affidavit of Ong Beng Tiong	16 May 1977
2.	Affidavit of Koh Kim Chai	12 February 1978
3.	Affidavit of Lim Cheun Ren	19 April 1978
4.	Affidavit of Koh Kim Chai	31 July 1978
5.	Notice informing that "further arguments would be heard in Open Court on 29 October 1978"	3 October 1978
6.	Notes of Proceedings in Chambers and in Open Court	16 October 1977 to 28 December 1978
7.	Grounds of Judgment of Syed Othman Bin Ali J.	28 December 1978
8.	Notice of Appeal to Federal Court	31 December 1978
9.	Memorandum of Appeal	8 November 1979
10.	Grounds of Judgment of the Federal Court	24 June 1980
11.	Notice of Motion	18 July 1980
12.	Affidavit of Koh Kim Chai	14 July 1980
13.	Affidavit of Poh Kar Chiow	29 July 1980
14.	Affidavit of Sivaran Singh Gill	31 July 1980
15.	Affidavit of R. Padmanabhan	2 August 1980

IN THE JUDICIAL COMMITTEE OF THE PRIVY COUNCIL

ON APPEAL

FROM THE FEDERAL COURT OF MALAYSIA

BETWEEN:

KOH KIM CHAI

10

20

Appellant (Chargor/Respondent)

- and -

ASIA COMMERCIAL BANKING CORPORATION LIMITED <u>
Respondent</u> (Chargee/Applicant)

RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS

No. 1

ORIGINATING SUMMONS

IN THE HIGH COURT OF MALAYA AT JOHORE BAHRU

CHARGEE'S APPLICATION

ORIGINATING SUMMONS) NO. 146 of 1977)

> In the Matter of a Chargee's Application under Sections 256 and 257 of the National Land Code, Act No. 56 of 1965

> > AND

In the Matter of a Charge dated the 22nd day of May 1973 bearing Presentation No. 5640/73, Charge Volume 179, Folio 3 on all that piece of land comprised and delineated in Grant 23940, Lot 2605, Mukim of Senai, Kulai, Johore

BETWEEN

In the High Court of Malaya at Johore Bahru

No. 1

Originating Summons

7 June 1977

1.

In the High Court of Malaya at Johore Bahru

No. 1

Originating Summons

7 June 1977

continued

AND

KOH KIM CHAI of No. 2-E Jalan Ah Fook, Johore Bahru Chargor/Respondent

ORIGINATING SUMMONS

LET KOH KIM CHAI of No. 2-E, Jalan Ah Fook, Wong Shee Fun Building, Johore Bahru within eight (8) days after service of this Summons on him, inclusive of the date of such service, cause an appearance to be entered for him to this Summons, which is issued upon the application of the abovenamed Chargee/Applicant, ASIA COMMERCIAL BANKING CORPORATION LIMITED of No. 110 Robinson Road, Singapore, 1 for an Order :-

- That all that piece of land comprised in Grant 1. 23940, Lot 2605 in the Mukim of Senai, Kulai and containing an area of 53 Acres 0 Rood 30 Poles or thereabouts be sold by public auction under the direction of The Senior Assistant Registrar;
- 2. That the sale be held on a date not less than one month after the date upon which this Order is made:
- 3. That the total amount due to the Chargee/Applicant in respect of the principal and interest up to the 9th day of January 1975 is \$95,292-24 which sum together with interest at the rate of 14.75% per annum to the 31st day of March 1977 amounts to \$128,964-09;
- That the Chargee/Applicant is further entitled to 4. interest at the rate of 14.75% per annum with monthly rests from the date of this Order to the date of realisation;
- 5. That the Senior Assistant Registrar of the Court shall further fix a reserve price for the purposes of the said sale equal to the estimated market value of the said land;
- That there be liberty to all parties to apply; 6.
- That the costs, charges, expenses of and incidental 7.

10

30

to this application and of the sale hereby directed be taxed by the Senior Assistant Registrar on the Higher Scale and be paid by the Chargor/Respondent to the Chargee/Applicant and the amount of such costs, charges and expenses when duly taxed may be added by the Chargee/ Applicant to the amount due for principal and interest owing under the said Charge.

Dated this 7th day of June, 1977.

In the High Court of Malaya at Johore Bahru

No. 1

Originating Summons

7 June 1977

continued

10

Sgd. Illegible

SENIOR ASSISTANT REGISTRAR, HIGH COURT, MALAYA, JOHORE BAHRU.

Entered No. 523/77

This Summons is taken out by Messrs. Yeow & Chin of No. 16-B, Jalan Station, Tan Chan Cheng Building, Johore Bahru, Solicitors for the abovenamed Chargee/Applicant.

The Chargor/Respondent may appear hereto by entering an appearance either personally or by Solicitor at the Registry of the High Court at Johore Bahru.

NOTE: If the Chargor/Respondent does not enter appearance within the time and at the place abovementioned, such order will be made and proceedings taken as the Judge may think just and expedient.

A person appearing personally may, if he desires, enter his appearance by post and the appropriate forms may be obtained by sending a Postal Order for \$5-00 with an addressed envelope to the Senior Assistant Registrar of the High Court at Muar.

30

To:

Koh Kim Chai, 2-E, Jalan Ah Fook, Wong Shee Fun Building, JOHORE BAHRU. No. 2

ORDER OF SYED OTHMAN BIN ALI J.

In the High Court of Malaya at Johore Bahru

No. 2

IN THE HIGH COURT IN MALAYA AT JOHORE BAHRU

CHARGEE'S APPLICATION

Order of Syed Othman Bin Ali J.

28 December 1978

ORIGINATING SUMMONS) No. 146 of 1977)

> In the Matter of a Chargee's Application under Sections 256 and 257 of the National Land Code, Act No. 56 of 1965.

AND

In the Matter of a Charge dated the 22nd day of May 1973 bearing Presentation No. 5640/73, Charge Volume 179, Folio 3 on all that piece of land comprised and delineated in Grant 23940, Lot 2605 Mukim of Senai, Kulai, Johore.

BETWEEN

ASIA COMMERCIAL BANKING CORPORATION LIMITED of No.110 Robinson Road, Singapore, 1. Chargee/Applicant

AND

KOH KIM CHAI of No. 2-E, Jalan Ah Fook, Johore Bahru.

Chargor/Respondent

BEFORE THE HONOURABLE MR.	IN CHAMBERS	
JUSTICE DATO' SERI SYED	THIS 28TH DAY OF	
OTHMAN BIN ALI	DECEMBER, 1978 30	

ORDER

UPON the application on the part of ASIA COMMERCIAL BANKING CORPORATION LIMITED, the abovenamed Chargee/Applicant, made by way of Originating Summons Entered No. 523 of 1977 dated the 7th day of June 1977 coming on for hearing on 23rd day of April, 1978 AND UPON further argument in Open Court on the 31st day of July 1978, 29th day of October

1978 and 28th day of December 1978 AND UPON **READING** the said Originating Summons and the Affidavit of Ong Beng Tiong affirmed on the 16th day of May 1977 and filed herein on the 7th day of June 1977 and the exhibits referred to therein and the Affidavit of A. Ghani bin Md. Tahir affirmed and filed on the 18th day of July 1977 and the exhibit referred to therein and the Affidavit of Lim Cheun Ren affirmed on the 19th day of April 1978 and filed herein on the 23rd day of April 1978 and the exhibit referred to therein and the Affidavit of Koh Kim Chai affirmed and filed herein on the 31st day of July 1978 AND UPON HEARING Miss Cheah Chew Kwe of Counsel for the abovenamed Chargee/Applicant and Mr. Paramjothy of Counsel for the abovenamed Chargor/ Respondent THIS COURT DOTH ORDER :-

- 1. That all that piece of land comprised in Grant 23940, Lot 2605 in the Mukim of Senai, Kulai and containing an area of 53 Acres 0 Rood 30 Poles or thereabouts be sold by public auction under the direction of the Senior Assistant Registrar;
- 2. That the sale be held on a date not less than one month after the date upon which this Order is made;
- 3. That the total amount due to the Chargee/Applicant in respect of the principal and interest at the rate of 14.75% per annum up to the 23rd day of April 1978 amounts to \$149,874-66;
- That the Chargee/Applicant is further entitled to 4. interest at the rate of 14.75% per annum with monthly rests from the 23rd day of April 1978 to the date of realisation:
- That the Senior Assistant Registrar of the Court 5. shall further fix a reserve price for the purposes of the said sale equal to the estimated market value of the said land;
- 6. That there be liberty to all parties to apply;
- 7. That the costs, charges, expenses of and incidental to this application and of the sale hereby directed be taxed by The Senior Assistant Registrar on the Higher Scale and be paid by the Chargor/Respondent to the Chargee/Applicant and the amount of such costs, charges and expenses when duly taxed be added by the Chargee/Applicant to the amount due

In the High Court of Malaya at Johore Bahru

No. 2

Order of Syed Othman Bin Ali J.

28 December 1978

continued

20

10

40

In the High Court of Malaya at Johore Bahru

No. 2

Order of Syed Othman Bin Ali J.

28 December 1978

continued

for principal and interest owing under the said Charge.

GIVEN under my hand and the Seal of the Court, this 28th day of December, 1978.

Sd. Abdul Kadir bin Musa.

Senior Assistant Registrar, High Court, JOHORE BAHRU.

In the Federal Court of Malaysia at Johore Bahru

No. 3

ORDER OF THE FEDERAL COURT

10

20

IN THE FEDERAL COURT OF MALAYSIA HOLDEN AT JOHORE BAHRU

Order of the Federal Court

No. 3

24 June 1980

(APPELLATE JURISDICTION)

FEDERAL COURT CIVIL APPEAL NO. 3 OF 1979

Between

KOH KIM CHAI

Appellant

And

ASIA COMMERCIAL BANKING CORPORATION LIMITED

Respondents

(In the Matter of Johore Bahru High Court Originating Summons No. 146 of 1977

Between

ASIA COMMERCIAL BANKING Chargee/ CORPORATION LIMITED Applicant

And

KOH KIM CHAI

Chargor/ Respondent)

CORAM: LEE HUN HOE, CHIEF JUSTICE, HIGH COURT, BORNEO; WAN SULEIMAN, JUDGE, FEDERAL COURT, MALAYSIA; ABDUL HAMID, JUDGE, FEDERAL COURT, 30 MALAYSIA.

> IN OPEN COURT. THIS 24TH DAY OF JUNE 1980

ORDER

THIS APPEAL coming on for hearing on the 3rd day of February 1980 in the presence of Encik V.C. George (Encik K.S. Narayanan with him) of Counsel for the Appellant and Encik Upali Masacorale (Encik Lim Cheun Ren with him) of Counsel for the Respondent AND UPON READING the Record of Appeal filed herein AND UPON HEARING Counsel as aforesaid for the parties IT WAS ORDERED that this Appeal do stand adjourned for Judgment AND the same coming on for Judgment this day at Kuala Lumpur in the presence of Encik V.C. George (Encik K.S. Narayanan with him) of Counsel for the Appellant and Encik Gan Eng Chee of Counsel for the Respondents IT IS ORDERED that this Appeal be and is hereby dismissed with costs to be taxed and be paid to the Respondents by the Appellant AND IT IS LASTLY ORDERED that the sum of \$500-00 (Ringgit Five Hundred only) paid into Court by the Appellant as security for costs of this Appeal be paid out to the Respondents towards taxed costs.

Given under my hand and the Seal of the Court, this 24th day of June 1980.

(Sd.) A.S. TAN

SENIOR ASSISTANT REGISTRAR, FEDERAL COURT, MALAYSIA, KUALA LUMPUR.

No. 4

ORDER GRANTING CONDITIONAL LEAVE TO APPEAL

IN THE FEDERAL COURT OF MALAYSIA HOLDEN AT KUALA LUMPUR

(APPELLATE JURISDICTION)

FEDERAL COURT CIVIL APPEAL NO. 3 OF 1979

BETWEEN

KOH KIM CHAI

Appellant

AND

ASIA COMMERCIAL BANKING CORPORATION LIMITED

Respondent

In the Federal Court of Malaysia at Johore Bahru

No. 3

Order of the Federal Court

24 June 1980

continued

No. 4

Order granting conditional leave to appeal

4 August 1980

10

In the Federal Court of Malaysia at Johore Bahru (In the Matter of Johore Bahru High Court Chargee's Application Originating Summons No. 146/1977

BETWEEN

Asia Commercial Banking Corporation Limited Chargee/Applicant

AND

Koh Kim Chai

4 August 1980

No. 4

Order granting conditional

leave to appeal

continued

CORAM: LEE HUN HOE, CHIEF JUSTICE, HIGH COURT, BORNEO; CHANG MIN TAT, JUDGE, FEDERAL COURT, MALAYSIA; SALLEH ABAS, JUDGE, FEDERAL COURT, MALAYSIA.

> IN OPEN COURT THIS 4TH DAY OF AUGUST 1980

Chargor/Respondent

UPON MOTION made unto the Court this day by Encik V.C. George of Counsel for the Appellant abovenamed in the presence of Encik Lim Cheun Ren Counsel for the Respondent abovenamed AND UPON READING the Notice of Motion dated the 18th day of July 1980, the Affidavit of Koh Kim Chai affirmed on the 14th day of July 1980, the Affidavit of Poh Kar Chiow affirmed on the 29th day of July 1980, the Affidavit of Sivaran Singh Gill affirmed on the 31st day of July 1980 and the Affidavit of R. Padmanabhan on the 2nd day of August 1980 all filed herein AND UPON HEARING Counsel for the Appellant and Counsel for the Respondent as aforesaid IT IS ORDERED that leave be and is hereby granted to the Appellant to appeal to His Majesty the Yang Di-Pertuan Agong against the whole of the decision of this Honourable Court given on the 24th day of June 1980 in Federal Court Civil Appeal No. 4 of 1979 which said decision is binding in this Appeal and in Federal Court Civil Appeal No. 5 of 1979, upon the following conditions:-

(a) that the Appellant abovenamed do within three (3) months from the date hereof enter into good and sufficient security to the satisfaction of the Chief Registrar of the Federal Court in the sum of M\$5,000.00 (Ringgit Five Thousand) only for the due prosecution of the Appeal and the payment of all such costs as may become payable to the Respondent abovenamed in the event of the abovenamed Appellant not obtaining an Order granting final leave to appeal or of the Appeal being

20

10

30

dismissed for non-prosecution or of His Majesty the Yang Di-Pertuan Agong ordering the abovenamed Respondent costs of the Appeal as the case may be; and

- (b) that the abovenamed Appellant do within three (3) months from the date hereof take the necessary steps for the purpose of procuring the preparation of the Appeal Record and despatch thereof to England.
- 10 AND IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the Appellant's prayer (b) contained in the Notice of Motion dated the 18th day of July 1980 requesting for the stay of execut ion of the Judgment of this Honourable Court given on the 24th day of June 1980 pending appeal on the said judgment to His Majesty the Yang Di-Pertuan Agong be and is hereby allowed AND IT IS LASTLY ORDERED that costs of the Appellant's application be costs in the cause.

GIVEN under my hand and the Seal of the Court this 4th day of August 1980.

20

Senior Assistant Registrar Federal Court, Malaysia, Kuala Lumpur.

(Sd.) A.S. TAN

This Order is filed by Messrs. Ng Ek Teong & Partners of 2nd Floor, Bangunan Persatuan Hokkien Selangor, Jalan Raja Chulan, Kuala Lumpur, Solicitors for the Appellant abovenamed.

No. 5

ORDER GRANTING FINAL LEAVE TO APPEAL

30

IN THE FEDERAL COURT IN MALAYSIA HOLDEN AT JOHORE BAHRU

(APPELLATE JURISDICTION)

FEDERAL COURT CIVIL APPEAL NO. 3 OF 1979

Between

In the Federal Court of Malaysia at Johore Bahru

No. 4

Order granting conditional leave to appeal

4 August 1980

continued

No. 5

Order granting final leave to Appeal 7 March 1981

In the Federal Court of Malaysia	Koh	Kim Chai And	Appellant	
at Johore Bahru No. 5		Commercial Banking ooration Limited	Respondent	
Order granting final leave to Appeal	(In the Matter of Johore Bahru High Court Originating Summons No. 146 of 1977			
7 March 1981		Between		
continued	Asia Commercial Banking Corporation Limited		Chargee/Applicant	
		And		
	Koh	Kim Chai	Chargor/Respondent	10
	CORAM: WAN SULEIMAN, ACTING CHIEF JUSTICE, HIGH COURT, MALAYA; SALLEH ABAS, JUDGE, FEDERAL COURT, MALAYSIA; ABDUL HAMID, JUDGE, FEDERAL COURT, MALAYSIA.			

ORDER

IN OPEN COURT THIS 7TH DAY OF MARCH 1981

UPON MOTION made on to Court this day by Encik 20 C. Paramjothy of Counsel for the Appellant and Encik Sivaran Singh Gill of Counsel for the Respondent abovenamed AND UPON READING the Notice of Motion dated the 30th January 1981 and the Affidavit of Encik K. S. Narayanan affirmed on the 29th January 1981 AND UPON HEARING Counsel for the Appellant aforesaid and Encik S.S. Gill Counsel for the Respondent abovenamed IT IS ORDERED that final leave be and is hereby granted to the Appellant to appeal to His Majesty the Yang Di-Pertuan Agong against the whole of the decision of this 30 Honourable Court given on the 24th June 1980 in Federal Court Civil Appeal No. 4 of 1979 which said decision is binding in this Appeal and in Federal Court Civil Appeal No. 5 of 1979.

Given under my hand and seal of the Court this 7th day of March 1981.

(Sd.) A.S. TAN SENIOR ASSISTANT REGISTRAR, FEDERAL COURT, MALAYSIA, KUALA LUMPUR.

This Order is filed by M/s Ng Ek Teong & Partners, Solicitors for the Appellant abovenamed whose address for service is at 2nd Floor, Bangunan Persatuan Hokkien Selangor, Jalan Raja Chulan, Kuala Lumpur.

In the Federal Court of Malaysia at Johore Bahru

No. 5

Order granting final leave to Appeal

7 March 1981

continued

11.

IN THE JUDICIAL COMMITTEE OF THE PRIVY COUNCIL

ON APPEAL

FROM THE FEDERAL COURT OF MALAYSIA

BETWEEN:

KOH KIM CHAI

Appellant (Chargor/Respondent)

- and **-**

ASIA COMMERCIAL BANKING CORPORATION LIMITED <u>Respondent</u> (Chargee/Applicant)

RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS

KINGSFORD DORMAN 14 Old Square Lincoln's Inn London WC2A 3UB.

Solicitors for the Appellant

COWARD CHANCE Royex House Aldermanbury Square London EC2V 7LD.

Solicitors for the Respondent