

FIRST-TIER TRIBUNAL PROPERTY CHAMBER (RESIDENTIAL PROPERTY)

Case Reference : MAN/OOBN/LDC/2021/0073

Property : Jefferson Place, 1 Fernie Street,

Manchester, M4 4AZ

Applicant : Redbank Manchester Limited

Representative : JB Leitch Limited

Respondents : Various Residential Long Leaseholders

See Annex A

Type of Application : Section 27A Landlord and Tenant Act

1985 - Section 20ZA

Tribunal Members : Tribunal Judge J.E. Oliver

Tribunal Member S.A. Kendall

Date of

Determination : 16th June 2022

Date of Decision : 4th July 2022

DECISION

Decision

1. The application to dispense with the consultation requirements imposed by Section 20 of the Landlord and Tenant Act 1985 ("the Act") regarding the works specified by the Applicant to ensure the safety of the residents at Jefferson Place, 1 Fernie Street, Manchester is granted.

Reasons

Background

- 2. This is an application made by Redbank Manchester Limited ("the Applicant") for the dispensation of the consultation requirements imposed by Section 20 of the Landlord & Tenant Act 1985 ("the Act") regarding works required to remedy the existing cladding system at Jefferson Place, 1 Fernie Street, Manchester ("the Property").
- 3. The Applicant has stated the current cladding does not comply with the current guidance and proposes to carry out certain works to remedy this. These works include: render, spandrel panels, metal cladding, insulation and sundry associated works, fire safety barriers, vents, signage and other fitments.
- 4. The Respondents to the application are the various long leaseholders of the Property ("the Respondents").
- 5. The application is dated 7th July 2021 and in respect of which directions were issued on 11th February 2022 providing for the filing of any objection by the Respondents and for the application to be determined without a hearing.
- 6. There was one formal objection to the application by the leaseholder of Apartment 16.05.

The Law

- 7. Section 20 of the Act provides:
 - (1) Where this section applies to any qualifying works or qualifying long term agreement, the relevant contributions of tenants are limited in accordance with subsection (6) or (7) (or both) unless the consultation requirements have been either-
 - (a) complied with in relation to the works or agreement, or
 - (b) dispensed with in relation to the works or agreement by (or on appeal from) a tribunal
 - (2) In this section "relevant contribution", in relation to a tenant and any works or agreement, is the amount which he may be required under the terms of his lease to contribute (by the payment of service charges) to relevant costs incurred on carrying out the works or under the agreement
 - (3) This section applies to qualifying works if relevant costs incurred on carrying out the works exceed an appropriate amount.
- 8. In the event the requirements of section 20 have not been complied with, or there is insufficient time for the consultation process to be implemented then

an application can be made to the First-tier Tribunal pursuant to section 20ZA of the Act.

9. Section 20ZA of the Act provides:

(1) Where an application is made to a tribunal for a determination to dispense with all or any consultation requirements in relation to any qualifying works, or qualifying long term agreement, the tribunal may make the determination if satisfied that it is reasonable to dispense with the requirements

Submissions

- 1. The Applicant is the landlord of the Property, a 18-storey residential block (including three basement car parking levels) with 309 apartments.
- 2. The Applicant has been made aware that remedial works are required to the Property relating to the construction of the external wall system and, in particular, that it is constructed of combustible materials and poses a fire risk.
- 3. The Applicant has appointed specialist firms to report further upon the work required to remedy the defects and they have recommended the works as referred to in paragraph 3 above. The cost of this work will require compliance with the consultation requirements of section 20 of the Act.
- 4. The Applicant has registered the Property with the Government Building Safety Fund due to the nature of the remedial work and has claimed for the full cost of the work, but this may not be granted. There is a dispute as to whether the white render construction type, forming part of the Property, is eligible for funding and further work is ongoing regarding this.
- 5. The Applicant has chosen to proceed with the work under a Design and Build procurement route which is where the appointed contractor both designs and constructs the work.
- 6. The Applicant has obtained tenders for the work and states Castles have provided the most cost-efficient quote, in the sum of £10,709,632.51 excluding VAT and fees. It is said that, at the time of the application., it was unknown when a final decision would be made in respect of the funding, but as and when a decision is made, work will need to commence at short notice.
- 7. The Applicant seeks dispensation from all consultation requirements since it is said it would not be practicable to comply with them given the method of funding, the procurement method for dealing with the works and the urgency of it. It is confirmed it has updated the Respondents with details of the works via an online portal and has also arranged several online resident meetings to discuss and advise on progress.
- 8. The Applicant submits the Respondents will not suffer any financial prejudice by the granting of dispensation. If dispensation is not granted and consultation is required then any government funding could be lost resulting in higher costs for the Respondents.
- 9. One objection to the application has been received. This said that due to the uncertainty regarding whether the white render will be included in the government funding, the possibility of additional costs to the Respondents will not be the subject of any consultation. The objection was conditional upon the Applicant fulfilling certain requirements as follows:
 - (1) Provide a detailed plan of the start, duration and sequence of the works to be conducted.

- (2) Provide evidence that manpower resources are in place and orders have been placed, with confirmed delivery schedules of the raw materials, to fulfil the sequence of works and without any risk of delay due to failed procurement processes and without the need for periods of pause or absence from sire.
- (3) Provide details of the building security measures which will be put in place whilst the work is underway, including access to any scaffolding and exterior access.
- (4) Provide confirmation that all sky telecom aerials, aerials and other communications fitments will not be disabled and full communication access will be maintained for all leaseholders and residents.
- 10. The Applicant submitted the conditional approval was unreasonable and the Respondents would not be prejudiced by dispensation being granted.

Determination

- 11. The Tribunal is being asked to exercise its discretion under section 20ZA of the Act. Section 20ZA (1) provides the Tribunal may do so where "if satisfied that it is reasonable to dispense with the requirements".
- 12. The Tribunal, having considered the submissions made by the Applicant, is satisfied the works are necessary and are urgent. It accepts that due to the steps taken to carry out the work, it is not practicable to carry out the consultation requirements contained within section 20 of the Act and dispensation is therefore granted under section 20ZA.
- 13. The Tribunal has considered the objections made but does not consider there is any prejudice to the Respondents by reason of a failure to carry out the consultation requirements.
- 14. The granting of dispensation does not affect the Respondents' rights to the challenge the reasonableness or the payability of the service charges under a separate application pursuant to section 27A of the Act.

Tribunal Judge J Oliver 4 July 2022 902 Jefferson Ltd

A Daniels, L G Daniels & S Alan

Alan Gordon & Ray Shevlin

Alan Louis Chierici

Alero Okiv

Alex Murchie & Helena Murchie

Alexander Norton

Ali Nazokkar & Arsam Nazokkar

Ali Reza Nazokkar

Andrew Bain

Andrew Johnson

Andrew Watkinson & Shelly Watkinson

Angela McCormick

Anne Cuddy

Anthony John Haralambous

Anthony Okoye

Anthony Thomas Harrison & Thomas Harrison

Antony Harrison

Appenzeller Properties Ltd

Arti Chudasama

Asara Enterprises Ltd

Barbara Mayling

Barclay Brown

Beckswood Properties Ltd

Blair Matthew Henry & Charlotte Victoria Taylor

Camilla Clayton & Ian Jack Clayton

Carmel Keane & Brian Keane

Carol Lam

Caroline King

Catharine Nancy Devereaux

Charlotte Mary Cunningham & Martin Sharrock

Chirag Jayendra Patel

Christopher Gerard Broadbent & Kate Broadbent

Christopher James Francis Roper

Chui Fun Lin

Chui Ha Siu

Clare Margaret Dixon

Cleto Jose Xavier Colaco

Clive Richard Hughes & Beverly Hughes

Constantinos Nicolaides

Curtis Gates

D N Gurney & J Gurney

Damian Taylor

Dandan Luo

Daniel Bleoju

Daniel Hickey

Danny Lynskey

David Battersby

David Koon Hang Chan & Diana Wing Yim Chan

Dhirendra Allen & Sonal Sharma

Diane Lyon

Dorcros Adetola & Evelyn Adesida

Dr & Mrs Khan

Dr & Mrs Sakhamuri

Dr A Jibril

Dr Ahmed Jibril

Dr J Yadav

Dr K Peddi

Dr K Peddi & Mrs K Peddi

Dr Louisa Pang

Dr M Mahmoud

Dr Mustafa Mahmoud

Dr R Kislov

Dr Stuart Bradley Downhill

Dr Sylvia Sham

Duncan Eric Sanders

Ehsan Ghayoorkarimiani & Asieh Ehsaei

Ekaterina Lurye

Elaine Dyson

Elizabeth Somes & Jeffrey Crisp

Fair General Investment Ltd

Faraaz Akhtar Nakvi

Farook Owadally & Seema Khan

Fat Chung Shum

Fu Yau Wong

Gemma Hunter

George Edward Perfitt

Gerard Foy & Mary Foy

Grace Kwan Hung Choi

Gurmukh Reehal

Habib Salem Dardouri

Han & Woo Kang

Hang Kin Tsang

Hannah Elizabeth Robinson

Hardev Sian & Bakshish Sian

Heung Wong & Sau Kuen Cecilia Man

Hongwei Wang & Mrs Jihau Xiang

Iain Thomas Disney

Irfan Chauhan

Irish UK LLC

Jack Lawton

Jacob Eastwood

James Daniel Ormerod Booth

James David Curtis

Jamie Cunliffe

Jamie Harrison

Jason & Peter J Nevitt

Jayesh Nayee & Meeta Nayee

Jennifer Osbourne

Jialu Wang

Joan Patricia Kiernan

Joanne Chan

Joanne Lund

John Charles Impey

John Fagan Williams

John Lee Guy

John Peter Kiernan

John Richard Webberley

John Robert Holmes & Karen Louise Holmes

John Rockett & Beverley Jayne Rockett

John Walmsley & Daniel Lee Baker

Jonathan Clark

Jonathan David Sharples

Jonathan Swan

Jonathon Lee Willett & Alexander Bowery Evans

Joseph Fernandes

Joshua Iza Brown

Julian N Moorbath

Julian Robert Nield & Diane Alison Nield

Julie English

Kapukai Investments Ltd

Karen Lesley Flint

Kefeng Zhang & Hui Zhang

Kenyon Thompson Ltd

Khaled Al-Sacid

Khalid Jassim Abdulla Althawadi

Kin Kwong Wong

Kris Andrew Donohue

Laura Rose Fowler & Michael James Harrison

Lee Eccles

LLC Blue Irvine

London & Kent Building Service Ltd

Lucinda Jane Longster

Luke Alexander Overton

Luke Smetherham

M & H Properties Ltd

Mahbub Zaman

Maria Duggal & Olivia Duggal

Marie Sleigh

Mark Andrew Wherrett

Mark Burgess & Nicola Tombling

Mark Kerins

Mark P Forster & Anneka K Burnett

Martin Jordan & Jillian Peta Jordan

Martin Lloyd Copeland & Gemma Anne Copeland

Matthew Edward Hamilton Tinning

Matthew Lyons

Michael Cox & Sharon Ingman

Michael Malone

Michael Page & Alessandra Sorrentino

Michael Richard Barnes

Michael Zhi Wong

Michal Bernas

Miss C Adikaram

Miss Rachel Harvey

Mohamed Ajmal

Mohamed Amr Aly Gamaleldin Hassanein

Mohammed Azam Khan & Shams Shaheen Azam

Mohammed Mughal

Mohammed Owolabi

Mohammed Yusuf

Montserrat Palau

Morgan Donnellan

Mostafa Ahmad Bahaa Elahwal

Mr & Mrs C Heaton

Mr & Mrs C Tao

Mr & Mrs S Bodla

Mr A & Mrs S M Fender

Mr A Chierici

Mr A Devine

Mr A J & Mrs E W Lane

Mr B & Mrs G Mitton

Mr B Spearing

Mr C J X Colaco

Mr Chaitanya Mangla

Mr D Hawley

Mr D Maxwell

Mr D P & Mrs V Blackburn

Mr D Roberts

Mr E McLoughney

Mr F Shum

Mr G Hunt

Mr G S & Mrs C S Daw

Mr Ghauri

Mr Isra Hussain

Mr J A & Mrs R J Annand

Mr J Impey

Mr J Moore

Mr J P Muff & Ms D E Beamish

Mr M Antoniou

Mr M B Mirza

Mr M Mirza

Mr Matthew James Street

Mr Mohammed Magsood

Mr N J Dawson & Mrs E M Dawson

Mr Patel

Mr Philip Welch & Mrs Raechel Welch

Mr Quan Gan

Mr R Jiskoot

Mr Rami Mahmoud

Mr S Hussain

Mr S J Best & Mrs D M Best

Mr S Whittle

Mr Tsz Kit Ieong

Mr Yiming Xu

Mrs J Calenti

Mrs J English

Mrs M Hanley

Mrs Nila Patel

Mrs S Khan

Mrs Shabina Akhtar

Ms C A Haslam

Ms C Whittlestone

Ms Hema Odedra

Ms I Ling

Ms J R O'Callaghan

Ms M Kevorkian

Ms N Brook

Ms N Brown

Ms Pamela Lockett

Ms S Barker

Ms S Hassan

Ms S Humphreys

Ms S L Humphreys

Ms S Younus

Muhammed Aitmad-Ur-Rab

Myles Oliver Martin & Georgia Mary Cotter

Nadeem Mohammad Agha & Nadiya Agha

Naomi Elizabeth Brook

Nasar Mohmood Malik & Neelofar Malik

Natalie Brown

Neil Mouatt & Linda Mouatt

Niteenkuman Samji

Nozomi Fukazawa & Pui Yan Crystal Lau

Owais Sharif & Uzma Owais

P Murthy & K L Murthy

Padraic Kiernan

Patrick O'Reilly

Paul Adam Stewart

Paul James Russell & Dale Andrew Goode

Paul Lode Albert Popelier

Peter D Girling

Peter James Collier

Peter Laurie Robertson

Peter Neville Smith & Ilona Claire Spencer-Smith

Peter Robertson

Philiip Hutchinson

Philip Peter Clegg

Praveen Kumar Maddula

Pritesh Ishverbhai Patel

RT Williams, JW Williams & S Peterson

Ramesh Virji Patel

Raymond Cooper & Tina Clinton

Raymond Leech & Sandra Leech

Richard David Sinclair Clarke

Richard Peter Fields

Robert Roczynski

Rohir Sood & Nisha Shah

Roman Kislov

Rosey Sethi

Ross Alexander Jones

Saira Akhter Khan

Saleem Shexad Khan

Salma Jabeen Younus

Sam O'Dongo

Samuel Horsley

Sandra Leech & Raymond Leech

Sean Cleaver

Seema Khurana

Shazia Azeem Sarwar & Nadia Sarwar

Shazli Azmi & Omair Razzaq

Shireen Sadreddini

Shivji Ramji Varsani

Shofiqul Razak

Shohreh Khorassani & Shameen Khorassani

Simon Adam Mobey

Simon Higginson

Simon Whittle

Sophie Alice Anderson

Stephanie Davies

Stephanie Hannington-Suen

Stephen Gerard Farrelly

Stephen Hancock & Alan Mildren

Stephen Marshall & Vikki S Marshall

Steven John Dugdale

Sunilkumar Harish Bhatt

Suresh Hirani

Susan Anisa Younis

Suzanne Barker

T S Mithran

Tariq Mahmood Hussain

Tat Cheong Raymond Fung

Thea Elisabeth Lee

Thomas David Woodward & Anne Marie

Woodward

Thomas Harrison & Antony Harrison

Thomas Kinsey

Timothy Peter Hoggard & Belinda Nora Hoggard

Ting Li Chan

Vasu Naidu Bonda

Vinay Mathur & Sadhana Mathur

Virendra Puri & Vyom Puri & Shivani Puri

Vladimir Kadochnikov & Larisa Kadochnikov

Vv Tran

Wai Fong Serin Lau

Wai Kuen Bonnie Cheuk

Wai Yung

William Lowe & Julie Carter-Lowe

Xijun Liu

Yashar Properties Ltd

Yochai Zorno

Yuen Shan Lui

Yuk Leung Fu

Zachary Samuel Mendelsohn

Zafar Rashid Kussar

Zeshi Wang & Xiao Yu

Zubair Hussain