9752



FIRST-TIER TRIBUNAL PROPERTY CHAMBER (RESIDENTIAL PROPERTY)

**Case Reference** 

: LON/00BK/LDC/2014/0001

**Property** 

Flats 1-36, 22, 23 & 24 Hyde Park

Square London W2 2NN

**Applicant** 

22-23-24 Hyde Park Square RTM

Company Limited.

Representative

**BLR Property Management** 

Limited.

Respondent :

Individual Lessees of 36

apartments at 22, 23 & 24 Hyde Park Square London W2 2NN

Representative

None

:

:

Type of Application

**Application for dispensation from** 

consultation requirements of

S.27ZA Landlord & Tenant Act 1985

**Tribunal Members** 

Judge S. McGrath

P. Tobin FRICS MCIArb

Date and venue of

Hearing

10 Alfred Place, London WC1E 7LR

**Date of Decision** 

18th February 2014

#### **DECISION**

#### **Decision of the tribunal**

The Tribunal decided to grant an order for dispensation from all consultation requirements under section 20 of the Landlord & Tenant Act 1985 relating to removal and replacement of a commercial gasfired central heating boiler and associated plumbing, gas-fitting and related work.

# The application

- On 20 December 2013, an application was made under S.20ZA of the Landlord & Tenant Act 1985 (the Act) by BLR Property Management Limited, as managing agent on behalf of the Right to Manage Company. The application related to emergency replacement of the communal boiler providing central heating and hot water to all 36 tenants. The applicant sought dispensation of consultation requirements under the Act.
- The applicant requested the case to be dealt with urgently. The Tribunal issued procedural directions on 02 January 2014, for the case to be decided on paper, i.e. without an oral hearing; this being the most appropriate and proportionate way of handling the case.

# The background

- The building had a communal heating and hot-water service powered by two old gas-fired boilers, one of which had broken down and was beyond repair. The second, back-up, boiler was also very old; all 36 tenants would be left without heating or hot water supplies if it were to fail.
- A statement of case was made by Mr John Galliers of BLR Property Management Limited, who provided copies of 2 contractors' estimates from Alpine Plumbers Limited, for £22,500 + VAT; and from CleanHeat, for £18,310.36 + VAT, respectively.
- The Tribunal was advised that all lessees had received notices of intention dated 20 December 2013, describing the proposed works to replace the communal gas-fired boiler and associated gas-fitting, plumbing and other works with the approximate cost.

- All lessees were informed in the Tribunal's Directions that the question of reasonableness or cost of the works was not part of this application; the sole purpose being to seek dispensation.
- 8 Nine separate lessees responded, expressly supporting the application. No objections were received form any tenant.

### Reasons for the Tribunal's decision

The Tribunal determines from the evidence that it would not have been reasonable for the full consultation process to have taken place. The breakdown occurred shortly before Christmas. The applicant is a Right to Manage Company. There was real concern about its ability to provide heating and hot-water supplies. All tenants were notified; nine expressly supported the application; none expressed any objection and the Tribunal infers that they did not oppose the application.

Name

S. McGrath President First Tier Tribunal (Property Chamber)

Date:

18 February 2014

# Appendix of relevant legislation

# Landlord and Tenant Act 1985 (as amended)

#### Section 18

- (1) In the following provisions of this Act "service charge" means an amount payable by a tenant of a dwelling as part of or in addition to the rent -
- (a) which is payable, directly or indirectly, for services, repairs, maintenance, improvements or insurance or the landlord's costs of management, and

(b) the whole or part of which varies or may vary according to the relevant costs.

- (2) The relevant costs are the costs or estimated costs incurred or to be incurred by or on behalf of the landlord, or a superior landlord, in connection with the matters for which the service charge is payable.
- (3) For this purpose -

(a) "costs" includes overheads, and

(b) costs are relevant costs in relation to a service charge whether they are incurred, or to be incurred, in the period for which the service charge is payable or in an earlier or later period.

### Section 19

(1) Relevant costs shall be taken into account in determining the amount of a service charge payable for a period -

(a) only to the extent that they are reasonably incurred, and

- (b) where they are incurred on the provisions of services or the carrying out of works, only if the services or works are of a reasonable standard; and the amount payable shall be limited accordingly.
- Where a service charge is payable before the relevant costs are incurred, no greater amount than is reasonable is so payable, and after the relevant costs have been incurred any necessary adjustment shall be made by repayment, reduction or subsequent charges or otherwise.

### Section 27A

- (1) An application may be made to the appropriate tribunal for a determination whether a service charge is payable and, if it is, as to -
- (a) the person by whom it is payable,
- (b) the person to whom it is payable,

(c) the amount which is payable,

(d) the date at or by which it is payable, and

(e) the manner in which it is payable.

(2) Subsection (1) applies whether or not any payment has been made.

- (3) An application may also be made to the appropriate tribunal for a determination whether, if costs were incurred for services, repairs, maintenance, improvements, insurance or management of any specified description, a service charge would be payable for the costs and, if it would, as to -
- (a) the person by whom it would be payable,
- (b) the person to whom it would be payable,
- (c) the amount which would be payable,
- (d) the date at or by which it would be payable, and
- (e) the manner in which it would be payable.
- (4) No application under subsection (1) or (3) may be made in respect of a matter which -
- (a) has been agreed or admitted by the tenant,
- (b) has been, or is to be, referred to arbitration pursuant to a post-dispute arbitration agreement to which the tenant is a party,
- (c) has been the subject of determination by a court, or
- (d) has been the subject of determination by an arbitral tribunal pursuant to a post-dispute arbitration agreement.
- (5) But the tenant is not to be taken to have agreed or admitted any matter by reason only of having made any payment.

#### Section 20

- (1) Where this section applies to any qualifying works or qualifying long term agreement, the relevant contributions of tenants are limited in accordance with subsection (6) or (7) (or both) unless the consultation requirements have been either—
- (a) complied with in relation to the works or agreement, or
- (b) dispensed with in relation to the works or agreement by (or on appeal from) the appropriate tribunal.
- (2) In this section "relevant contribution", in relation to a tenant and any works or agreement, is the amount which he may be required under the terms of his lease to contribute (by the payment of service charges) to relevant costs incurred on carrying out the works or under the agreement.
- (3) This section applies to qualifying works if relevant costs incurred on carrying out the works exceed an appropriate amount.
- (4) The Secretary of State may by regulations provide that this section applies to a qualifying long term agreement—
- (a) if relevant costs incurred under the agreement exceed an appropriate amount, or
- (b) if relevant costs incurred under the agreement during a period prescribed by the regulations exceed an appropriate amount.

- (5) An appropriate amount is an amount set by regulations made by the Secretary of State; and the regulations may make provision for either or both of the following to be an appropriate amount—
- (a) an amount prescribed by, or determined in accordance with, the regulations, and
- (b) an amount which results in the relevant contribution of any one or more tenants being an amount prescribed by, or determined in accordance with, the regulations.
- (6) Where an appropriate amount is set by virtue of paragraph (a) of subsection (5), the amount of the relevant costs incurred on carrying out the works or under the agreement which may be taken into account in determining the relevant contributions of tenants is limited to the appropriate amount.
- (7) Where an appropriate amount is set by virtue of paragraph (b) of that subsection, the amount of the relevant contribution of the tenant, or each of the tenants, whose relevant contribution would otherwise exceed the amount prescribed by, or determined in accordance with, the regulations is limited to the amount so prescribed or determined.]

### Section 20B

- (1) If any of the relevant costs taken into account in determining the amount of any service charge were incurred more than 18 months before a demand for payment of the service charge is served on the tenant, then (subject to subsection (2)), the tenant shall not be liable to pay so much of the service charge as reflects the costs so incurred.
- (2) Subsection (1) shall not apply if, within the period of 18 months beginning with the date when the relevant costs in question were incurred, the tenant was notified in writing that those costs had been incurred and that he would subsequently be required under the terms of his lease to contribute to them by the payment of a service charge.

#### Section 20C

- (1) A tenant may make an application for an order that all or any of the costs incurred, or to be incurred, by the landlord in connection with proceedings before a court, residential property tribunal or the Upper Tribunal, or in connection with arbitration proceedings, are not to be regarded as relevant costs to be taken into account in determining the amount of any service charge payable by the tenant or any other person or persons specified in the application.
- (2) The application shall be made—
- (a) in the case of court proceedings, to the court before which the proceedings are taking place or, if the application is made after the proceedings are concluded, to a county court;

- (aa) in the case of proceedings before a residential property tribunal, to that tribunal;
- (b) in the case of proceedings before a residential property tribunal, to the tribunal before which the proceedings are taking place or, if the application is made after the proceedings are concluded, to any residential property tribunal;
- (c) in the case of proceedings before the Upper Tribunal, to the tribunal;
- (d) in the case of arbitration proceedings, to the arbitral tribunal or, if the application is made after the proceedings are concluded, to a county court.
- (3) The court or tribunal to which the application is made may make such order on the application as it considers just and equitable in the circumstances.

# Commonhold and Leasehold Reform Act 2002

# Schedule 11, paragraph 1

- (1) In this Part of this Schedule "administration charge" means an amount payable by a tenant of a dwelling as part of or in addition to the rent which is payable, directly or indirectly—
- (a) for or in connection with the grant of approvals under his lease, or applications for such approvals,
- (b) for or in connection with the provision of information or documents by or on behalf of the landlord or a person who is party to his lease otherwise than as landlord or tenant,
- (c) in respect of a failure by the tenant to make a payment by the due date to the landlord or a person who is party to his lease otherwise than as landlord or tenant, or
- (d) in connection with a breach (or alleged breach) of a covenant or condition in his lease.
- But an amount payable by the tenant of a dwelling the rent of which is registered under Part 4 of the Rent Act 1977 (c. 42) is not an administration charge, unless the amount registered is entered as a variable amount in pursuance of section 71(4) of that Act.
- (3) In this Part of this Schedule "variable administration charge" means an administration charge payable by a tenant which is neither—
- (a) specified in his lease, nor
- (b) calculated in accordance with a formula specified in his lease.
- (4) An order amending sub-paragraph (1) may be made by the appropriate national authority.

# Schedule 11, paragraph 2

A variable administration charge is payable only to the extent that the amount of the charge is reasonable.

# Schedule 11, paragraph 5

- (1) An application may be made to the appropriate tribunal for a determination whether an administration charge is payable and, if it is, as to—
- (a) the person by whom it is payable,
- (b) the person to whom it is payable,
- (c) the amount which is payable,
- (d) the date at or by which it is payable, and
- (e) the manner in which it is payable.
- (2) Sub-paragraph (1) applies whether or not any payment has been made.
- (3) The jurisdiction conferred on the appropriate tribunal in respect of any matter by virtue of sub-paragraph (1) is in addition to any jurisdiction of a court in respect of the matter.
- (4) No application under sub-paragraph (1) may be made in respect of a matter which—
- (a) has been agreed or admitted by the tenant,
- (b) has been, or is to be, referred to arbitration pursuant to a post-dispute arbitration agreement to which the tenant is a party,
- (c) has been the subject of determination by a court, or
- (d) has been the subject of determination by an arbitral tribunal pursuant to a post-dispute arbitration agreement.
- (5) But the tenant is not to be taken to have agreed or admitted any matter by reason only of having made any payment.
- (6) An agreement by the tenant of a dwelling (other than a post-dispute arbitration agreement) is void in so far as it purports to provide for a determination—
- (a) in a particular manner, or
- (b) on particular evidence,
- of any question which may be the subject matter of an application under subparagraph (1).